Here is a structured comparison and feedback on the four Supertrend strategies:

**🔍 Strategy Comparison**

| **Feature/Aspect** | **Batch-1** | **Batch-2** | **Batch-3** | **OpenAlgo Merged** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Symbols** | BSE, JBMA, ANGELONE | HDFCBANK, SBIN, etc. (8 stocks) | BHARATFORG, EUREKAFORB, DODLA | ADANIENT |
| **ATR Period / Multiplier** | 10 / 1.2 | 12 / 1.5 | 5 / 0.8 | 5 / 1.5 |
| **Indicators Used** | Supertrend, VWAP, RSI, MACD | Supertrend, VWAP, RSI, MACD | Supertrend, VWAP, RSI, ADX | Supertrend, VWAP |
| **Trailing SL Activation** | 0.25% trigger, 0.4% trail | 0.25% trigger, 0.2% trail | 1% trigger, 0.75% trail | Profit-based, 0.6% trail |
| **Target / SL (%)** | 1 / 0.5 | 1 / 0.4 | 4 / 2 | 0.8 / 0.4 |
| **Partial Booking Trigger** | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% | 0.5% |
| **Max Trades per Day** | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| **Exit Enhancements** | Supertrend reversal, trailing logic | Supertrend reversal, trailing logic | Time-based (15m stagnation), volatility filter | Drop-from-peak logic, retry orders |
| **Signal Logic** | RSI > 50, MACD > Signal, VWAP confirm | RSI > 50, MACD > Signal, VWAP confirm | RSI, ADX > 15, PrevHigh/Low buffer, VWAP | Supertrend + VWAP crossover only |
| **Error Handling / Logging** | Moderate | Moderate | Extensive diagnostics & robust logging | Enhanced logging with retry and flush |

**🧠 Feedback Summary**

**✅ Strengths:**

* **Batch-3**:
  + Most comprehensive: adds volatility filter, buffered entries, time-based exit.
  + Uses ADX for trend strength validation—improves signal quality.
  + Detailed logging and structured decision logic.
* **Batch-1 and Batch-2**:
  + Good use of multi-indicator confirmation (RSI + MACD + VWAP).
  + Implement dynamic trailing and partial exits.
  + More conservative and safer for ranging markets.
* **OpenAlgo Merged**:
  + Leanest and fastest to execute.
  + Slippage buffer, smart order logic, retry mechanism.
  + Clean code structure and ideal for single-symbol focus.

**❌ Weaknesses:**

* **Batch-1 and Batch-2**:
  + Somewhat verbose logic and duplicated code blocks.
  + Exit logic could be optimized—too many conditions handled together.
  + RSI and MACD calculations are hard-coded and lack flexibility.
* **Batch-3**:
  + High complexity may increase latency.
  + Frequent logging may slow real-time performance.
* **OpenAlgo Merged**:
  + Lacks secondary indicators (e.g., RSI or MACD)—could lead to false signals.
  + Only uses VWAP for trend confirmation, which may underperform in sideways markets.

**📌 Recommendations:**

* Use **Batch-3** for robust intraday trading with strong trend validation.
* Use **OpenAlgo Merged** for fast execution in volatile, directional markets.
* Consider unifying RSI/MACD/ADX into a flexible indicator module for **Batch-1/2**.
* Consolidate entry/exit logic into reusable functions to reduce redundancy.
* Yes, the current **Merged Supertrend Strategy** in your canvas can be considered the most complete and **ideal** version among all the variants you provided. Here's a concise comparison:
* **✅ Why This Merged Strategy Stands Out**

| **Feature** | **Included in Merged Version?** | **Comments** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Multi-indicator confirmation (ST, RSI, MACD, ADX, VWAP) | ✅ | Strong filter against false signals |
| Real **partial profit booking** | ✅ | Executed as real orders |
| **Trailing stop-loss** (adaptive) | ✅ | Trigger + dynamic trailing |
| **Trend reversal logic** | ✅ | Auto exit + reverse position |
| **Telegram alerts** | ✅ | Entry, exit, partials, errors |
| Clean structure and naming | ✅ | Lowercase and modular |
| Real-time logging | ✅ | With timestamp |
| State tracking per symbol | ✅ | For multi-symbol trades |
| Configurable entry window and limits | ✅ | Via start\_time, max\_trades\_per\_day |
| Error handling | ✅ | Try-except blocks per symbol |

* **🆚 Compared to Older Batches**

| **Batch** | **Key Weaknesses** |
| --- | --- |
| Batch 1/2 | No reversal logic, mixed logic for entries/exits, partials not always real |
| Batch 3 | Rich features but high complexity and fragmented logic |
| OpenAlgo | Fast, but limited indicators and lacks multi-symbol generality |

**Strategy Comparison**

****

